

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:</b>  <b>Ethicon Wave 1 cases listed in Exhibit A</b>	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN OPINIONS  
AND TESTIMONY OF JOSEPH CARBONE, M.D.**

Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court preclude defense expert Joseph Carbone, M.D., from giving opinions on (1) the safety and efficacy of Defendants' products based on his own clinical practice; (2) the design of Defendants' transvaginal mesh products at issue, including the safety and efficacy of those devices; and (3) the adequacy of Defendants' product warnings and instructions for use. The basis for Plaintiffs' motion is more fully set out in the accompanying Memorandum.

Dated: April 21, 2016

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Thomas P. Cartmell

---

Thomas P. Cartmell, Esq.  
Jeffrey M. Kuntz, Esq.  
Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP  
4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300  
Kansas City, MO 64112  
Telephone: (816) 701-1100  
Facsimile: (816) 531-2372  
[tcartmell@wcllp.com](mailto:tcartmell@wcllp.com)  
[jkuntz@wcllp.com](mailto:jkuntz@wcllp.com)

/s/ D. Renee Baggett

---

Bryan F. Aylstock, Esq.  
Renee Baggett, Esq.  
Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC  
17 East Main Street, Suite 200  
Pensacola, Florida 32563  
Telephone: (850) 202-1010  
Facsimile: (850) 916-7449  
[baylstock@awkolaw.com](mailto:baylstock@awkolaw.com)  
[rbaggett@awkolaw.com](mailto:rbaggett@awkolaw.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I filed the foregoing document on April 21, 2016, using the Court's CM-ECF filing system, thereby sending notice of the filing to all counsel of record in this matter.

/s/Thomas P. Cartmell  
**Attorney for Plaintiffs**

## INDEX OF EXHIBITS

**Exhibit A:** List of cases on which Dr. Carbone is designated

**Exhibit B:** Carbone TVT Expert Report

**Exhibit C:** Carbone Prolift Expert Report

**Exhibit D:** Carbone TVT Deposition Day 1, March 16, 2016

**Exhibit E:** Carbone TVT Deposition Day 2, March 17, 2016

**Exhibit F:** Carbone Prolift Deposition, March 16-17, 2016